



**HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES
2ND FLOOR ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT CONFERENCE ROOM
DECEMBER 12, 2011
4:00 P.M.**

The El Paso Historic Landmark Commission held a public hearing in the City Council Chambers, 2nd Floor, City Hall Building, December 12, 2011, 4:00 p.m.

Chair Riccillo called the meeting to order at 4:09 p.m.

The following Commissioners were present:

Mr. Joe Riccillo, Chair
Ms. Stephanie Fernandez
Mr. Joel Guzman
Mr. Ricardo Gonzalez (4:25 p.m.)
Mr. Randy Brock (4:13 p.m.)
Mr. David Berchermann

The following City Staff were present:

Ms. Cynthia Osborn, City Attorney's Office, Assistant City Attorney
Ms. Providencia Velázquez, Planning, Historic Preservation Officer

I. CALL TO THE PUBLIC – PUBLIC COMMENT

None

CHANGES TO THE AGENDA

None.



Two Civic Center Plaza
El Paso, TX 79901
(915) 541-4027

Mayor

John F. Cook

City Council

District 1

Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2

Susie Byrd

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Eddie Holguin Jr.

District 7

Steve Ortega

District 8

Cortney Carlisle Niland

City Manager

Joyce A. Wilson



MOTION:

Motion made by Chair Riccillo, seconded by Commissioner Guzman and
UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE THE AGENDA AS IT STANDS.

NOT PRESENT FOR THE VOTE: Commissioners Brock and Gonzalez

II. REGULAR AGENDA – DISCUSSION AND ACTION

1. Vice-Chair election.

Chair Riccillo suggested the Commissioners move the item to later in the meeting. Chair Riccillo requested Staff begin the presentation on the next agenda item.

After the vote on agenda item 2., Commissioners revisited agenda item 1.

Chair Riccillo asked Commissioners for their nominations for Vice-Chair of the Historic Landmark Commission.

NOMINATIONS

1. Commissioner Berchelmann nominated Commissioner Guzman.
2. Commissioner Guzman nominated Commissioner Gonzalez.

Chair Riccillo explained the duties of the Vice-Chair are to act as the Chair in the absence of the Chair. Chair Riccillo noted that his term expires in April, 2012; therefore, Commissioners will need to nominate a Chair and Vice-Chair at that time.

Mayor

John F. Cook

City Council

District 1

Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2

Susie Byrd

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Eddie Holguin Jr.

District 7

Steve Ortega

District 8

Cortney Carlisle Niland

City Manager

Joyce A. Wilson



Two Civic Center Plaza
El Paso, TX 79901
(915) 541-4027



MOTION:

Motion made by Commissioner Guzman, seconded by Commissioner Fernandez and **UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO NOMINATE COMMISSIONER GONZALEZ AS VICE-CHAIR.**

NOT PRESENT FOR THE VOTE: Commissioner Gonzalez

Certificate of Appropriateness

2. **PHAP11-00036:** Lot 31 and the East ½ of Lot 32, Block 10, Sunset Heights Addition, City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas
- Location: 624 Prospect
- Historic District: Sunset Heights
- Property Owner: Corey Louis Stoerner
- Representative: Jose Escobedo
- Representative District: #8
- Existing Zoning: A-2/H (Apartment/Historic)
- Year Built: 1904
- Historic Status: Contributing
- Request: Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a rear addition.
- Application Filed: 12/06/2011
- 45 Day Expiration: 1/19/2012

Commissioner Brock arrived during the PowerPoint presentation.

Ms. Velázquez gave a PowerPoint presentation and stated The Historic Preservation Office recommends **APPROVAL** of the proposed scope of work based on the following recommendations:



Two Civic Center Plaza
El Paso, TX 79901
(915) 541-4027

Mayor

John F. Cook

City Council

District 1

Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2

Susie Byrd

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Eddie Holguin Jr.

District 7

Steve Ortega

District 8

Cortney Carlisle Niland

City Manager

Joyce A. Wilson



The Magoffin Historic District Design Guidelines recommend the following:

- New additions should be planned so that they are constructed to the rear of the property or on a non-character defining elevation.
- Additions should complement the original structure, but not necessarily attempt to duplicate or copy it.

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation recommend the following:

- New additions will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property.
- The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale, proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.

Ms. Velázquez explained that existing accessory structures meet all setback requirements. Staff will assist the applicant in selecting the color of the wood panels. For the proposed addition, Ms. Velázquez explained, two of the existing rear windows will be covered.

Commissioner Guzman suggested rather than wood paneling the applicant might consider hardy board or equivalent.

MOTION:

Motion made by Commissioner Guzman, seconded by Chair Riccillo and **UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE THE CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR THE CONSTRUCTION OF THIS REAR ADDITION AND TO COMMEND THE OWNER FOR IMPROVING THIS PROPERTY.**

NOT PRESENT FOR THE VOTE: Commissioner Gonzalez



Two Civic Center Plaza
El Paso, TX 79901
(915) 541-4027

Mayor

John F. Cook

City Council

District 1

Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2

Susie Byrd

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Eddie Holguin Jr.

District 7

Steve Ortega

District 8

Cortney Carlisle Niland

City Manager

Joyce A. Wilson



*Prior to discussing the following item, Commissioners revisited agenda item 1.
Prior to discussing the following item, newly elected Vice-Chair Gonzalez arrived.*

3. Addresses of property HLC Commissioners have requested that HLC staff review or investigate and provide a report to the HLC. If no addresses are submitted in advance and listed under this agenda item, Commissioners may announce such addresses under this agenda item. Discussion on property announced at this meeting will take place during the next regularly scheduled meeting. December 12, 2011 deadline for HLC members to request for agenda items to be scheduled for the January 9, 2012 meeting. January 9, 2012 deadline for HLC members to request for agenda items to be scheduled for the January 23, 2012 meeting.

- A. Magoffin Villas at 915, 917, 1001 Magoffin Avenue and 1000, 1008, 1010 Myrtle Avenue

Ms. Velázquez gave a PowerPoint presentation and noted tenants are moving in.

Based on advertisements, Vice-Chair Gonzalez explained, rents are between \$800.00 and \$1,000.00 for one or two bedroom apartments. Vice-Chair Gonzalez requested Staff continue to leave the item on future agendas.

- B. Fall Mansion at 1725 Arizona Avenue

Ms. Velázquez noted work continues, Engineering Staff continues to provide updates to HLC Staff.

Vice-Chair Gonzalez commented on the recent construction of a stone structure on which to place a sign.

Mayor

John F. Cook

City Council

District 1

Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2

Susie Byrd

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Eddie Holguin Jr.

District 7

Steve Ortega

District 8

Cortney Carlisle Niland

City Manager

Joyce A. Wilson



Two Civic Center Plaza
El Paso, TX 79901
(915) 541-4027



Ms. Velázquez will research whether or not the stone structure was included in the plans.

C. Houston Elementary at 2851 Grant Avenue

No new information.

D. Alamo Elementary at 500 South Hills Street

Ms. Velázquez explained community members have requested EPISD not allocate the bond monies, previously approved by the voters for Alamo Elementary, to Hart Elementary. Additionally, community members have expressed an interest in saving the building and reopening it as school.

E. 1033 Upson Drive

Ms. Velázquez explained this case was presented to Commissioners September, 2011. Commissioners unanimously voted to deny the request for the painting of the brick façade after-the-fact. The property owners appealed the decision to City Council; City Council upheld Commissioners' decision to deny. City Council gave the property owners 90 days to remove the paint and to date the paint has not been removed. If the paint is not removed after 90 days, Code Enforcement will be notified.

HLC Staff Report

4. Update on Administrative Review Cases since last HLC meeting for the properties listed on the attachment posted with this agenda.
(See Attachment "A")

No comments from Commissioners.



Two Civic Center Plaza
El Paso, TX 79901
(915) 541-4027

Mayor

John F. Cook

City Council

District 1

Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2

Susie Byrd

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Eddie Holguin Jr.

District 7

Steve Ortega

District 8

Cortney Carlisle Niland

City Manager

Joyce A. Wilson



Planning & Economic Development Department Reports

5. None.

Visionaries in Preservation Report

6. None.

Other Business

7. A. Approval of Special Meeting Minutes for November 7, 2011 and Regular Meeting Minutes for November 14, 2011.

SPECIAL MEETING MINUTES – NOVEMBER 7, 2011

Minutes will be reviewed and/or approved at the January 9, 2012 meeting.

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES – NOVEMBER 14, 2011

Chair Riccillo asked Commissioners if they had any additions/corrections/revisions. There being none.

MOTION:

Motion made by Chair Riccillo, seconded by Commissioner Berchelmann and **UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE THE NOVEMBER 14, 2011 MEETING MINUTES.**

B. Discussion and action on application review regarding demolition changes. (Pending determination from the Legal Department)

No new information. Staff will remove the item from the agenda until such time as a determination from the Legal Department is made.

Mayor

John F. Cook

City Council

District 1

Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2

Susie Byrd

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Eddie Holguin Jr.

District 7

Steve Ortega

District 8

Cortney Carlisle Niland

City Manager

Joyce A. Wilson



Two Civic Center Plaza
El Paso, TX 79901
(915) 541-4027



- C. Discussion and action determining how properties are designated Contributing and Non-Contributing properties.

Ms. Velázquez explained that one of the differences between Contributing and Non-Contributing properties is that Contributing properties are eligible for tax credits. She added that the Contributing and Non-Contributing properties list should be updated.

Chair Riccillo gave background information regarding properties already designated with an H-overlay; however, the City's system had not appropriately rezoned the properties with the H-overlay designation. Chair Riccillo added that property owners may "tear into" Non-Contributing properties without having to come before the HLC for approval beforehand.

Ms. Velázquez wrote to both the National Trust Legal Department and the National Alliance of Preservation Commissions regarding the issue of "tearing into" Non-Contributing properties. Ms. Velázquez read into the record her letters and responses from the National Trust Legal Department and the National Alliance of Preservation Commissions. In summary, Ms. Velázquez explained that basically the letters state that each municipality gets to decide how much we will allow a non-contributing property to adhere/not adhere to the guidelines. Ms. Velázquez noted that the only set of guidelines referencing Contributing and Non-Contributing properties is within the Downtown Historic District Design Guidelines.

Chair Riccillo had concerns that the guidelines, as they stand, are enforceable regarding non-contributing properties.

Ms. Osborn gave legal guidance.

Mayor

John F. Cook

City Council

District 1

Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2

Susie Byrd

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Eddie Holguin Jr.

District 7

Steve Ortega

District 8

Cortney Carlisle Niland

City Manager

Joyce A. Wilson



Two Civic Center Plaza
El Paso, TX 79901
(915) 541-4027



In his opinion, Vice-Chair Gonzalez reminded Commissioners that these are just "guidelines;" Commissioners can still make decisions regarding non-contributing properties in the Downtown district based on all facts presented to the Commission.

Ms. Velázquez stated there is no legal significance regarding contributing and non-contributing properties and that the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Rehabilitation don't differentiate between contributing and non-contributing properties.

Vice-Chair Gonzalez clarified Commissioners are tasked with enforcing the code; however, Commissioners are also guided, not ordered or commanded, by the Guidelines.

Chair Riccillo requested Staff remove the item from future agendas.

D. Discussion on the Downtown Historic District Design Guidelines.

At this time, Staff is currently updating and revising these guidelines; when completed Staff will present the revised guidelines to Commissioners. Additionally, Staff would like to change the title from "Downtown Historic District Guidelines" to "Guidelines to the Downtown Historic District and Commercial Properties within Historic Districts."

Chair Riccillo requested Staff leave this item on for future agendas.

E. Discussion on the San Jacinto Plaza.

No new information. Commissioners requested Staff leave the item on future agendas.

Mayor

John F. Cook

City Council

District 1

Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2

Susie Byrd

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Eddie Holguin Jr.

District 7

Steve Ortega

District 8

Cortney Carlisle Niland

City Manager

Joyce A. Wilson



Two Civic Center Plaza
El Paso, TX 79901
(915) 541-4027

Dedicated to Outstanding Customer Service for a Better Community

S E R V I C E S O L U T I O N S S U C C E S S



MOTION:

Motion made by Chair Riccillo, seconded by Commissioner Guzman and
**UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO ADJOURN THE HISTORIC LANDMARK
COMMISSION MEETING AT 4:49 P.M.**

Mayor

John F. Cook

City Council

District 1

Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2

Susie Byrd

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Eddie Holguin Jr.

District 7

Steve Ortega

District 8

Cortney Carlisle Niland

City Manager

Joyce A. Wilson



Two Civic Center Plaza
El Paso, TX 79901
(915) 541-4027